



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING FEBRUARY 9, 2017

ALPHARETTA CITY HALL
COUNCIL CHAMBERS
2 PARK PLAZA
3:00 PM

- I. CALL TO ORDER**
 - a. Election of 2017 Officers**
- II. ROLL CALL**
- III. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES**
 - a. August 2016**
- IV. ITEMS FROM BOARD MEMBERS**
- V. ITEMS FROM STAFF**
 - a. Discussion on City Attorney recommended Revisions to HPC Proposed Changes to Text Amendments to Historic Preservation Incentive Zoning Ordinance**
 - b. Powers of HPC**
- VI. PUBLIC HEARING**
- VII. ADJOURNMENT**



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES
MEETING OF AUGUST 11, 2016

Department of Community Development
WWW.ALPHARETTA.GA.US
678.297.6070

*This summary is provided as a convenience and service to the public, media and staff. It is not the intent to record proceedings verbatim. Any reproduction of this summary must include this notice. Public comments are noted as heard by The Historic Preservation Commission, but not quoted or paraphrased. This document includes limited presentation by The Planning Commission and invited speakers in **summary** form. **This is not an official record** of the Alpharetta Historic Preservation Commission Meeting proceedings. Official Minutes are recorded and available for review.*

I. **CALL TO ORDER**

II. **ROLL CALL**

- Historic Preservation Board Members Present
 - Bonnie Steadman, Chairman
 - Sue Rainwater, Vice-Chairman
 - Ben Hollingsworth
 - Mary Lee
 - Connie Mashburn
 - Joy Ross
- Staff Present
 - Kathi Cook, Director of Community Development
 - Elle Taylor

III. **APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES**

a. **March 10, 2016 Meeting Minutes**

- ❖ Vice Chairman Rainwater offered a motion to approve as submitted
 - The motion received a second from Commission Member Lee
 - The motion passed by vote (6-0)

b. **July 21, 2016 Meeting Minutes**

No action taken. Deferred until next meeting.

IV. ITEMS FROM BOARD MEMBERS

There was discussion of Page 2 of Ordinance- items that constitute a material change in appearance.

Director Cook clarified the process of designation and/or addition to Resource List. If the HPC is aware of issues with a certain property that may affect the exterior architectural or environmental features of a history property, then it probably should not be added to the List. It is up to this Commission to consider whether the additions/changes to a property warrant that it not be deemed a Historic Property. Properties on the Resource List should be significant enough that the HPC would be comfortable later designating the property as Historic. Director Cook stated that each property should be looked at individually by the HPC to determine if the alterations are significant enough that the HPC would no longer consider it a historic property. If property is on the Resource List it is because the HPC thought it had historic significance and met criteria. There was discussion that it is difficult to justify a percentage of reconstruction. There was discussion of changes to the Rainwater House.

Director Cook stated the two criteria for adding a Historic Property.

1. It is an outstanding example of a building representative of its era and over 75 years old; or
2. It is one of the few remaining examples of a past architectural style or type and over 75 years old.

The HPC is considering the addition of two more criteria:

3. Extent/Type of Changes to the Building (Exterior Primarily)
4. Historical Significance of the Property

There was discussion of McCollum House at 31 North Main Street

V. ITEMS FROM STAFF

Director Cook thanked the Commission for their work on the Resource List. Staff will update the Commission on comments from the City Attorney and the date for City Council.

VI. PUBLIC HEARING

a. HPC Recommendation of Proposed Changes to the Historic Incentive Zoning Ordinance

The HPC went through list of proposed changes to the Ordinance.

Addition of two new criteria for designation of a Historic Property:

3. Extent/Type of Changes to the Building (Exterior Primarily)
4. Historical Significance of the Property

There was discussion of meaning of Historical significance of the Property being from former prominent Alpharettans.

There was discussion of 242 Milton Ave (Trammell House).

There was discussion that 37 Church Street is Homer Lowery House.

The Commission recommended:

Removals:

31 Church St (Previously considered but not in present Ordinance)
1720 Old Milton Parkway
32 Old Canton Street
38 Old Canton Street
37 Church Street (Lowery House)

Additions:

133 Cumming Street
11 Old Canton Street
1240 Mayfield Road
1835 Mayfield Road
760 Old Rucker Road
20 Milton Ave
80 School Drive
29 South Main Street
50 South Main Street
1405 Mid-Broadwell Road

There was discussion that 21 Milton House was already considered by Council and removed so it will not be reconsidered.

There was discussion on:

36 Church Street (Devore House) – meets two of the Criteria. It will remain on the list.

31 North Main Street (McCollum House) – meets two of the Criteria. It will remain on the list.

37 Church Street (Lowery House) – does not meet two of the Criteria. It will be proposed to be removed.

There was discussion of changing B. Criteria for Designation of a Historic Property to:

The property is an individual building deemed worthy of preservation and the benefits available due to such status by reason of value to the City, the region, the State of Georgia, or the nation for **two** or more of the following reasons:

That change would make sure that there was more criteria than the property being over 75 years old.

There was discussion that there are not many properties left that will qualify so it is difficult to remove properties from the list. Director Cook clarified that Manning House will not be removed from Downtown.

- ❖ Vice Chairman Rainwater offered a motion to recommend to the City Council that revisions be made to Ordinance #712 regarding the changes that were discussed today at the Public Hearing and that the changes that were discussed today be put into the record and recommend approval to the City Council
 - The motion received a second from Commission Member Hollingsworth
 - The motion passed by vote (6-0)

There was discussion on:

- City Council has not appointed a replacement for Larry Garmon.
- Request that City Attorney attend to offer orientation for the role of Commission Members.
- Thompson House, plain, rectangular house and little house that is part of the Presbyterian Church.
- Removal of #4 from the Procedure for Designation of Historic Properties:
- Notification of Historic Preservation Division: No less than thirty (30) days prior to making a recommendation on any ordinance designating a property as historic, the HPC must submit the report, required in Subparagraph A.3. of this Subsection, to the Historic Preservation Division of the Department of Natural Resources.

Director Cook stated we can make the recommendation subject to the City Attorney's approval.

- ❖ Commissioner Mashburn offered a motion to remove :

Notification of Historic Preservation Division. No less than thirty (30) days prior to making a recommendation on any ordinance designating a property as historic, the HPC must submit the report, required in Subparagraph A.3. of this Subsection, to the Historic Preservation Division of the Department of Natural Resources.

From Ordinance #712.

- The motion received a second from Commission Member Rainwater
- The motion passed by vote (6-0)

There was discussion on

- Item E2 page 9 of the Ordinance regarding bronze as a material.
- Timetable for plaques once homes are designated.

VII. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 4:19 p.m.



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING JULY 21, 2016

ALPHARETTA CITY HALL
Multi- Purpose
Room
2 PARK PLAZA
3:00 PM

*This summary is provided as a convenience and service to the public, media and staff. It is not the intent to record proceedings verbatim. Any reproduction of this summary must include this notice. Public comments are noted as heard by The Historic Preservation Commission, but not quoted or paraphrased. This document includes limited presentation by The Planning Commission and invited speakers in **summary** form. **This is not an official record** of the Alpharetta Historic Preservation Commission Meeting proceedings. Official Minutes are recorded and available for review.*

I. CALL TO ORDER

II. ROLL CALL

- Historic Preservation Board Members Present
 - Bonnie Steadman, Chairman
 - Sue Rainwater, Vice-Chairman
 - Ben Hollingsworth
 - Mary Lee
 - Joy Ross
- Staff Present
 - Kathi Cook, Director of Community Development
 - Elle Taylor

III. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES of March 10, 2016

No action taken.

IV. ITEMS FROM BOARD MEMBERS

V. ITEMS FROM STAFF

VI. PUBLIC HEARING

a. Discussion of Historic Properties List:

- Proposals of additions and removals to Historic Sites Options List.
- Log Cabin
- Claudia Lewis House

There was no action taken at this meeting.

VII. ADJOURNMENT

([Ord. No. 712](#), § 1(Exh. A), 9-8-2015)

2.9.4 Recommendation and designation of historic properties.

A. Preliminary Research by HPC.

1. Survey of Local Historic Resources. The HPC shall compile and collect information on historic resources within the City, including the preparation and maintenance of an inventory of all property within the City having the potential for designation as historic. Records shall be maintained in accordance with the City's records management plan.
2. Recommendation for Historic Designation. Pursuant to the procedure provided herein for consideration of properties for designation as historic, the HPC shall present to the City Council recommendations regarding the designation of historic properties. Notwithstanding any other provision of the UDC or City Code to the contrary, the HPC, not the Planning Commission, shall make recommendations to the City Council regarding the designation of a historic property.
3. Documentation Supporting Recommendation for Designation of Historic Property. Prior to the HPC's recommendation to the City Council of a property to designate as historic, the HPC shall prepare a report for recommendation consisting of:
 - a. A detailed physical description of the proposed historic property; and
 - b. A statement of the historical, cultural, architectural, and/or aesthetic significance of the proposed historic property; and
 - c. A map showing the boundaries of the proposed property; and
 - d. A statement justifying the boundaries of the proposed property; and
 - e. Representative photographs of the proposed property.

B. Criteria for Designation of a Historic Property. In order to be designated a historic property, the following criteria must be met:

The property is an individual building deemed worthy of preservation and the benefits available due to such status by reason of value to the City, the region, the State of Georgia, or the nation for ~~one~~ **two** or more of the following reasons:

1. It is an outstanding example of a building representative of its era and over 75 years old; or
2. It is one of the few remaining examples of a past architectural style or type and over 75 years old.
3. **Extent/Type of Changes to the Building (Exterior Primarily)**
4. **Historical Significance of the Property**

C. Procedure for Designation of Historic Properties.

1. Application for Designation of Historic Property. An application for designation of a historic property or historic properties may be submitted by:
 - a. The owner of the subject property; or
 - b. The City Council, via majority vote, subject to the written consent of the property owner(s);
or

- c. The HPC, via majority vote, subject to the written consent of the property owner(s).
2. Required Components of Designation Ordinance. Any ordinance designating any property as historic shall:
 - a. List and describe the proposed individual historic property or properties;
 - b. Set forth the name(s) of the owner(s) of the proposed historic property or properties;
 - c. Show the property or properties on the official zoning map of the City of Alpharetta, Georgia, with the letters "HP" (historic property) added to the zoning designation for the subject property in order to keep and maintain a public record providing notice of such designation (e.g., property zoned R-15 and designated as a historic property pursuant to this Ordinance/Section shall be shown as R-15HP on the official zoning map).
3. Public Hearings. The HPC and the City Council shall each hold a public hearing on any proposed ordinance for the designation of a historic property. Such public hearings may be held on the same date. The HPC shall make a recommendation to the City Council and the City Council will take final action. Notice of the public hearing shall be published in at least three consecutive issues of a newspaper of general circulation within the territorial boundaries of the City, with one of such notices being published at least fifteen (15) days, but not more than forty-five (45) days prior to the date of the hearing, and written notice of the hearing shall be mailed not less than ten (10) nor more than twenty (20) days prior to the date set for the public hearing. A notice sent via the United States mail to the last known address of the property owner as such address appears in the City ad valorem tax records and a notice sent to the address of the property to the attention of the occupant shall constitute legal notification to the owner and occupant under this section. Such public hearings and the provisions of notice for same shall otherwise be performed in a manner consistent with the requirements of the Georgia Zoning Procedures Law (O.C.G.A. § 36-66-1, et seq.) and the City public hearing process for a proposed zoning change; provided, however, the HPC, not the Planning Commission, shall serve as the recommending body to the City Council in regard to such matters.
4. [Notification of Historic Preservation Division. No less than thirty \(30\) days prior to making a recommendation on any ordinance designating a property as historic, the HPC must submit the report, required in Subparagraph A.3. of this Subsection, to the Historic Preservation Division of the Department of Natural Resources.](#)
5. Recommendation on Proposed Designation. A recommendation to affirm, modify, withdraw, or reject the proposed ordinance for designation shall be made by the HPC following the public hearing and shall be in the form of a resolution to the City Council.
6. City Council Action Following HPC's Recommendation. Following receipt of the HPC recommendation, the City Council may adopt the ordinance for designation as proposed, may adopt the ordinance with any amendments it deems necessary, or reject the ordinance.
7. Notification of Adoption of Ordinance for Designation. Within thirty (30) days following the adoption of the ordinance for designation by the City Council, the owners and occupants of each designated historic property shall be given written notification of such designation by the City Council, which notice shall apprise said owners and occupants of the necessity of obtaining a certificate of appropriateness prior to undertaking any material change in appearance of the historic property. A notice sent via the United States mail to the last-known owner of the property shown on the City of Alpharetta tax digest and a notice sent via United States mail to the address of the property to the attention of the occupant shall constitute legal notification to the owner and occupant under this Section.
8. Notification of Other Agencies Regarding Designation. The HPC shall notify all necessary agencies within the City of the ordinance for designation.

9. Moratorium on Applications for Alteration or Demolition while Designation is Pending. If an ordinance for designation is being considered, the HPC shall notify the permitting division of the Community Development Department. No permit of any kind shall be issued for work which would constitute a material change in the appearance of a building, structure, site, or landscaping located on the proposed property until the proposed ordinance is adopted or rejected by the City Council or otherwise withdrawn by the applicant.
- D. Effect of Historic Property Designation. Subject to a property owner's compliance with regulations set forth herein, the designation of a "historic property" makes additional zoning and other benefits available to owners of such properties, which may be used at their option. After the designation by ordinance of a historic property, no material change in the appearance of such historic property shall occur or be permitted to be made by the owner or occupant thereof unless or until an application for a certificate of appropriateness has been submitted to and approved by the HPC, as further set forth herein. Such designation is further intended to serve as the local designation of a historic property in order to govern the applicability of other City ordinances, codes, and regulations, including building and construction codes, containing provisions that reference or apply to "historic" buildings, structures or properties when the subject provision does not expressly limit same to buildings, structures or properties listed on the National or State Register of Historic Places or otherwise define same.
- E. Removal of Designation. After a property has been designated as a historic property, such designation may thereafter be rescinded and removed by the City Council by the adoption of an ordinance to remove such designation. The adoption of such an ordinance and the procedures applicable thereto shall be consistent with the procedures required for the designation of a property as historic. The City Council may remove such designation upon a finding that the property no longer meets the subject criteria for designation or when it otherwise finds such removal to be in the public interest.

([Ord. No. 712](#), § 1(Exh. A), 9-8-2015)

[Ord. No. 712](#), § 1(Exh. A), 9-8-2015)

2.9.4 Recommendation and designation of historic properties.

A. Preliminary Research by HPC.

1. **Survey of Local Historic Resources.** The HPC shall compile and collect information on historic resources within the City, including the preparation and maintenance of an inventory of all property within the City having the potential for designation as historic. Records shall be maintained in accordance with the City's records management plan.
2. **Recommendation for Historic Designation.** Pursuant to the procedure provided herein for consideration of properties for designation as historic, the HPC shall present to the City Council recommendations regarding the designation of historic properties. Notwithstanding any other provision of the UDC or City Code to the contrary, the HPC, not the Planning Commission, shall make recommendations to the City Council regarding the designation of a historic property.
3. **Documentation Supporting Recommendation for Designation of Historic Property.** Prior to the HPC's recommendation to the City Council of a property to designate as historic, the HPC shall prepare a report for recommendation consisting of:
 - a. A detailed physical description of the proposed historic property; and
 - b. A statement of the historical, cultural, architectural, and/or aesthetic significance of the proposed historic property; and
 - c. A map showing the boundaries of the proposed property; and
 - d. A statement justifying the boundaries of the proposed property; and
 - e. Representative photographs of the proposed property.

B. Criteria for Designation of a Historic Property.

In order to be designated a historic property, the following criteria must be met:

The property is an individual building deemed worthy of preservation and the benefits available due to such status by reason of value to the City, the region, the State of Georgia, or the nation for one or more of the following reasons:

1. It is an outstanding example of a building representative of its era and over 75 years old; or
2. It is one of the few remaining examples of a past architectural style or type and over 75 years old.
3. **Extent/Type of Changes to the Building (Exterior Primarily)**
4. **Historical Significance of the Property**

Criteria for Designation of a Historic Property.

1. In order to be designated a historic property, the property must be an individual building that meets the following criteria:
 - a. Is of historic, cultural, aesthetic or architectural significance to the City, the region, the State, or the nation;
 - b. Possesses historic integrity (in terms of its location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association) for all periods related to the significance of the property; and
 - c. Is deemed worthy of preservation (and the benefits available due to such status) by reason of value to the City, the region, the State, or the nation for one or more of the following reasons:
 - i. It is an outstanding example of a building representative of its era and over 75 years old;
 - ii. It is one of the few remaining examples of a past architectural style or type and over 75 years old; or
 - iii. It is a place associated with an event or person(s) of historic or cultural significance to the City, the region, the State, or the nation and over 75 years old.

When evaluating a property for designation, consideration shall be given to the following factors related to the historic significance and integrity of the property:

- a. The reason the property is significant to the historical, cultural, aesthetic, or architectural heritage of the City, the region, the State of Georgia, or the nation, including:
 - i. The historic context with which the property is associated;
 - ii. Whether the property is associated with the historic context in an important way; and
 - iii. The relative importance of the era or architectural style of the building or the event or person associated with the building in the historical, cultural, aesthetic, or architectural heritage of the City, the region, the State of Georgia, or the nation.
- b. Whether the property has retained the essential physical features that enable it to convey its historic identity, including:
 - i. The ability of the building to convey its significance;
 - ii. The authenticity of the building's physical identity as evidenced by the survival of characteristics that existed during the building's period of significance;
 - iii. Whether and the extent to which the historic character, significant architectural features, historic elements, and overall design of the original structure have remained intact or been altered;
 - iv. Whether the removal of historic materials or the alteration of distinctive exterior features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize the property has been minimal; and
 - v. Whether and the extent to which any prior repairs, alterations, additions, or material changes in appearance of exterior architectural features of the property have had an adverse effect on the historic, cultural, aesthetic or architectural significance and value of the property.

Procedure for Designation of Historic Properties.

1. Application for Designation of Historic Property. An application for designation of a historic property or historic properties may be submitted by:
 - a. The owner of the subject property; or
 - b. The City Council, via majority vote, subject to the written consent of the property owner(s); or
 - c. The HPC, via majority vote, subject to the written consent of the property owner(s).
2. Required Components of Designation Ordinance. Any ordinance designating any property as historic shall:
 - a. List and describe the proposed individual historic property or properties;
 - b. Set forth the name(s) of the owner(s) of the proposed historic property or properties;
 - c. Show the property or properties on the official zoning map of the City of Alpharetta, Georgia, with the letters "HP" (historic property) added to the zoning designation for the subject property in order to keep and maintain a public record providing notice of such designation (e.g., property zoned R-15 and designated as a historic property pursuant to this Ordinance/Section shall be shown as R-15HP on the official zoning map).
3. Public Hearings. The HPC and the City Council shall each hold a public hearing on any proposed ordinance for the designation of a historic property. Such public hearings may be held on the same date. The HPC shall make a recommendation to the City Council and the City Council will take final action. Notice of the public hearing shall be published in at least three consecutive issues of a newspaper of general circulation within the territorial boundaries of the City, with one of such notices being published at least fifteen (15) days, but not more than forty-five (45) days prior to the date of the hearing, and written notice of the hearing shall be mailed not less than ten (10) nor more than twenty (20) days prior to the date set for the public hearing. A notice sent via the United States mail to the last known address of the property owner as such address appears in the City ad valorem tax records and a notice sent to the address of the property to the attention of the occupant shall constitute legal notification to the owner and occupant under this section. Such public hearings and the provisions of notice for same shall otherwise be performed in a manner consistent with the requirements of the Georgia Zoning Procedures Law (O.C.G.A. § 36-66-1, et seq.) and the City public hearing process for a proposed zoning change; provided, however, the HPC, not the Planning Commission, shall serve as the recommending body to the City Council in regard to such matters.
4. Notification of Historic Preservation Division. No less than thirty (30) days prior to making a recommendation on any ordinance designating a property as historic, the HPC must submit the report, required in Subparagraph A.3. of this Subsection, to the Historic Preservation Division of the Department of Natural Resources.

In regard to the proposed deletion of subparagraph 4 of 2.9.4(C), submittal of the report to the State Historic Preservation Division is required by State law (O.C.G.A. 44-10-26). I would advise that it not be deleted. (See Attached)

5. Recommendation on Proposed Designation. A recommendation to affirm, modify, withdraw, or reject the proposed ordinance for designation shall be made by the HPC following the public hearing and shall be in the form of a resolution to the City Council.
6. City Council Action Following HPC's Recommendation. Following receipt of the HPC recommendation, the City Council may adopt the ordinance for designation as proposed, may adopt the ordinance with any amendments it deems necessary, or reject the ordinance.
7. Notification of Adoption of Ordinance for Designation. Within thirty (30) days following the adoption of the ordinance for designation by the City Council, the owners and occupants of each designated historic property shall be given written notification of such designation by the City Council, which notice shall apprise said owners and occupants of the necessity of obtaining a certificate of appropriateness prior to undertaking any material change in appearance of the historic property. A notice sent via the United States mail to the last-known owner of the property shown on the City of Alpharetta tax digest and a notice sent via United States mail to the address of the property to the attention of the occupant shall constitute legal notification to the owner and occupant under this Section.
8. Notification of Other Agencies Regarding Designation. The HPC shall notify all necessary agencies within the City of the ordinance for designation.
9. Moratorium on Applications for Alteration or Demolition while Designation is Pending. If an ordinance for designation is being considered, the HPC shall notify the permitting division of the Community Development Department. No permit of any kind shall be issued for work which would constitute a material change in the appearance of a building, structure, site, or landscaping located on the proposed property until the proposed ordinance is adopted or rejected by the City Council or otherwise withdrawn by the applicant.

RED: Recommended Addition per HPC Motion August 2016

BLUE: Recommended Removal per HPC Motion August 2016

GREEN: City Attorney Revisions

Powers of Historic Preservation Commission

Statement of the HPC's Power. Without limiting authority provided elsewhere in this, or any other, ordinance, the HPC shall be authorized to:

1. Prepare, update and maintain an inventory of all properties and buildings within the City having the potential for designation as a historic property and recommend historic buildings for listing in the City's Historic Resources Inventory — Contributing Historic Buildings;
2. Recommend to the City Council specific buildings (and adjacent land) to be designated by ordinance as a historic property;
3. Recommend to the City Council that any designation of a historic property be removed;
4. Conduct public hearings on all applications for designation of a historic property;
5. Review applications for certain benefits available to historic properties, as may be delegated to the HPC by the City Council, and make recommendations or otherwise provide its approval (with or without modifications) or denial of same, as applicable;
6. Review historic preservation plans and make recommendations or otherwise provide its approval (with or without modifications) or denial of same, as applicable, in accordance with the provisions of this Section;
7. Recommend design guidelines for historic properties, not inconsistent with this Section, for adoption by the City Council;
8. Subject to funding availability and with the prior approval of the City Council, undertake the restoration or preservation of any historic properties acquired by the City;
9. Promote any and all programs related to historic properties established by the City, including the acquisition by the City of facade easements and conservation easements, as appropriate, in accordance with the provisions of the Georgia Uniform Conservation Easement Act (O.C.G.A. §§ 44-10-1 through 44-10-8);
10. Conduct educational programs on historic properties located within the City;
11. Make such investigations and studies of matters relating to historic preservation, including consultation with historic conservation or preservation experts, as the City Council may, from time to time, deem necessary or appropriate for the purposes of preserving historic resources;
12. Upon request of the City Council, recommend to the City Council other possible historic preservation incentive programs for their review;
13. Retain persons with professional expertise to carry out specific tasks, if necessary, subject to approval by the City Council;
14. Work with designated members of City staff, who will serve as liaisons between HPC and the City Council; and
15. Review and perform such other duties and functions as expressly delegated to the HPC by the City Council.